United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN-DESA) and United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia (UN-ESCWA)

Stakeholder Consultation Workshop

"Strengthening Capacity to Utilize Sustainable Development Principles in National Policy-Making in Lebanon"

Date: September 6-7, 2011

Location: UN House, Beirut, Lebanon

Workshop Report

SUMMARY

The Stakeholder Consultation Workshop "Strengthening Capacity to Utilize Sustainable Development Principles in National Policy-Making in Lebanon" gathered key stakeholders from government, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and UN agencies to promote trans-sectoral dialogue on national sustainable development policy-making in Lebanon.

During the two-day workshop, the attendees were briefed on National Sustainable Development Strategies and the Development Account Project ROA-105: "Strengthening National Capacity for the Integration of Sustainable Development Principles into Development Strategies in Countries Emerging from Conflict." The participants were also invited to partake in interactive exercises, during which they identified key development challenges in Lebanon and brainstormed potential solutions to implement through the country's national sustainable development plans.

During the 2-day workshop, the participants actively engaged in the activities and demonstrated their interest in collaborating to promote sustainable development. This report further details the background of sustainable development in Lebanon, summarizes the main debates and concerns raised by the participants, and notes the effect of the workshop on national sustainable development strategy in Lebanon.

Contents

INTRODUCTION

Prior to the workshop, a consultative exercise with potential stakeholders and experts on the ground revealed concerns about the political climate and its bearing on sustainable development in Lebanon. The invited stakeholders had considerable experience in the areas of policy-making, planning, and sustainable development and were familiar with the obstacles surrounding these issues in Lebanon. For example, the Lebanese government has been in transition during the months leading up to the workshop (January- June 2011). Moreover, the previous government had established an Inter-Ministerial Committee (IMC) to ensure coordination and planning, and its fate under the new government was unclear at the time of the workshop. Several of the workshop's participants had been a part of a technical committee that supported IMC. These and other participants further articulated trepidation regarding the objectives of the workshop, as their respective ministries and organizations had provided thorough policy reports to the legislature and felt that those had been put on hold. In sum, the participants vocalized that they felt rather powerless in their roles, and questioned the purpose of the workshop.

BACKGROUND[1]

Like many countries emerging from conflict, Lebanon faces the challenge of working towards a national strategy that would integrate sustainable development and peace building approaches. These have been known to help prevent potential relapses into conflict (UNDESA 2011). Thus far, Lebanon has not yet drafted a National Sustainable Development Strategy (NSDS). It has however, over the last decade, issued a number of national strategies, policies, and assessments that could pave the way for a sound NSDS. Achievements and challenges of planning, drafting, and implementing national strategies and policies are not divorced from the political context. Lebanon's economic, social, environmental, and political performances have been shaped by its recent political history, which is fraught with a series of conflicts that have set the country off its developmental track. Lebanon's predicament today can be seen as the summation of an interconnection of internal and external factors.

> **Internal Factors**: There are internal factors that render Lebanon a conflict-sensitive setting. Historically deep-rooted systems of sectarianism and political confessionalism, failing to attain national reconciliation, poor institutional governance coupled with lack of accountability are some of the 'structural causes of conflict' (UNDESA 2011: 26) that have outlived the Civil War and continue to afflict the country today.

---

[1] This section is extracted from the background report, Obeid, M. (2011). Review and Assessment of Capacity for Sustainable Development in Lebanon. UNESCWA, July 2011.

External Factors: The external factors include Lebanon's position vis-à-vis the regional and international politics and its relationship with its neighboring countries. Events such as the assassination of Prime Minister Hariri, the withdrawal of the Syrian military, the Special Tribunal for Lebanon, the 2008 War with Israel and the continuing issue of Palestinian and other refugees in Lebanon are some of the ongoing and current issues connected to external factors.

These challenges have meant that Lebanon's government has been time and again preoccupied with immediate damages caused by the war, or, more generally, with reform that relates to ' a state of emergency' rather than policy-making. As a result, entire sectors have suffered neglect (social development, equal distribution of wealth, human rights, gender, the environment and sound governance), to the advantage of narrow recovery strategies that target the economy and reconstruction. Since 2007, Lebanon's strategies for reform have shifted toward more comprehensive approaches that recognize aspects of sustainable development, that are participatory and consultative in nature (hence, including to an extent a variety of stakeholders) and that attempt to synergize the economy, society and the environment. The materialization of these legitimate concepts of sustainable development into implementation processes will depend on the stability of the political situation, on one hand, and the ability of the current government to maintain 'trust' and stabilize the environment, on the other.

There are three conceptual domains of sustainable development: economy, environment and society. Within each element, development strategies have been written to address sustainable development. Below are some examples of strategies that aim to various degrees to cross over several sectors.[2] These were used as examples for discussion in the workshop working groups.

> **Economy**: The Lebanese Government's main reform programme 'Recovery, Reconstruction and Reform,' was altered after the July War of 2006 to be presented at the *International Conference in Support of Lebanon* – or *the Paris III* Meeting. The economic policy aimed to address the reduction of debt, the increase of real growth and privatization. For the first time since the Civil War, the programme included a Social Action Plan that aimed at improving social indicators, which would reflect a better employment profile and tackle the persistent regional inequalities in Lebanon. Although the social dimension was welcome, the reform programme fell short of directly addressing governance issues and environmental degradation. The 2009 government upgraded the reform programme through the Progress and Development Policy statement to Parliament in 2009. In this policy statement, the government recognized the need to address both issues of the environment, governance and public administration, and expanded on the social objectives to include gender and other social objectives. As a result of this statement, the government sought the support of the World Bank Group and developed a Country Partnership Strategy for the years 2011-2014.

> **Environment**: The environment has been an area that received less concern than necessary by policy making and planning. It was completely absent from the 2007 reform programme, despite recognition of the serious level of environmental degradation,

---

[2] It is important to note that the strategies are not exhaustive and as each Ministry has its own plan, strategies overlap each other more often than not.

especially after the 2006 July War. Environmental objectives were incorporated into the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) priorities, based on the 2007 CCA (Common Country Assessment), among other assessments. It was only till 2010 that the Ministry of Environment developed a three-year programme (2010-2012), which has not yet been approved by government. Although the programme shows a positive step, it still needs to incorporate the role of stakeholders outside of government (civil society and private sector) through the process of decentralization, to have a stronger take on regulatory and legal frameworks to safeguard the environment and to have a clear implementation plan. Conceptually, the programme needs to bring out the interconnections between environmental and socio-economic sustainability. There are opportunities to develop environmental objectives, especially that Lebanon is a signatory of the Rio Conventions and has shown commitment to international agreements. But Lebanon's 'compliance' with these conventions lags behind its institutional 'implementation.'

Society: This is an area which has recently received attention by the Lebanese government. The Ministry of Social Affairs, building on the Social Action Plan of 2007, developed with the IMC a National Social Development Strategy of Lebanon (NSDSL).The NSDSL builds on the Ministry of Social Affairs' previous initiative of the Social Pact whose aim is to establish a 'citizenship-based Civil State,' which commits to the principles of equality in rights and obligations to a set of socio-economic rights. The NSDSL, unlike other initiatives, recognizes the linkages between economy, society and environment and bases its approach on people-centered, inclusive and participatory principles. This document bases its strategy on sustainable development concepts, and, although it does not develop a set of outputs and a timeline for implementation, it shows a comprehensive approach to development. The UNDAF Report (2010) that built on the two main 2007 strategies, in addition to the CCA of 2007 and the knowledge base of the UNCT (United Nations Country Team), develops a set of objectives that cover some of the gaps in previous plans and highlights areas for development in Lebanon, namely, democratic governance and institutional development, human rights, gender and environmental sustainability.

The process of national sustainable development in Lebanon is distinctive from other countries as the nation does not currently have a National Vision or Poverty Reduction Strategy. Rather, it has a collection of development strategies that have emerged from different ministries and organizations.

NSDS and the Guidance Notes

The Development Account project ROA-105 "Strengthening National Capacity for the Integration of Sustainable Development Principles into Development Strategies in Countries Emerging from Conflict" was launched to improve on the previous NSDS Guidance Notes, "Guidance in Preparing a National Sustainable Development Strategy: Managing Sustainable Development in the New Millennium" (2002) which did not address the unique challenges experienced by nations dealing with conflict. The latest Guidance Notes, "Developing National Sustainable Development Strategies in Post-Conflict Countries," were developed to help fill this

gap by outlining principles for taking realistic and situational approaches in developing conflict-sensitive national sustainable development strategies. While the Guidance Notes focus on building upon already existing national development strategies and planning processes, an innovative approach was needed in Lebanon as this country does not yet have a comprehensive plan. Thus, the goal of the workshop in Lebanon was to support a cross-sectoral interaction, encourage ongoing engagement from various stakeholders, and provide a space for cross-sectoral discussion on the topics of sustainable development and peacebuilding despite Lebanon's complex political climate.

The Guidance Notes were developed to help governments address the interlinked challenges of peacebuilding and sustainable development, and more specifically, to provide guidance on how to approach sustainable development in conflict-affected countries. In addition, they can support all other actors involved in development processes in conflict-affected societies, such as civil society organizations, the private sector, donors, and development organizations, as well as country and field-level practitioners. The Guidance Notes have been developed to support development in countries emerging from conflict; this includes detailed description of the unique challenges that characterize conflict contexts and methods for addressing those through sustainable development planning.

OBJECTIVES

The stakeholder consultation workshop in Lebanon achieved the following predefined objectives:

- **Objective 1**: Share guidelines for conflict-sensitive sustainable development strategies.

- **Objective 2**: Scope past and present Lebanese development strategies.

- **Objective 3**: Develop action plans to achieve goals and address challenges in national sustainable development strategy planning in Lebanon.

- **Objective 4**: Overview of the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development 2012 (Rio +20).

- **Objective 5**: Facilitate networking between professionals with different types of expertise.

ATTENDANCE

The stakeholder consultation workshop brought together 18 key Lebanese stakeholders (national government, country experts, and others) and development partners associated with the UN-system, all of whom are contributing or have contributed to sustainable development planning. The list of participants is included in attached Annex 2.

LANGUAGE

The Stakeholder Consultation Workshop was hosted primarily in English with Arabic/English simultaneous translation available.

DISCUSSION TOPICS

To lift the participants' expectedly low morale, ESCWA invited key government officials from the Presidency of the Council of Ministers to address the attendees' concerns and to encourage dialogue between the different stakeholders on how to effectively promote sustainable development in Lebanon, including Mr. Ziad Mikati and Mr. Ramzi Naaman from the Presidency of the Council of Ministers. They participated actively in the workshop, and listened to the participants' individual and collective concerns. They also announced the new government's plan to look into re-activating the IMC and putting in place mechanisms for coordination among ministries and other concerned stakeholders in order to address sustainable development needs in Lebanon. Also included among such coordinating and mobilizing mechanisms is the idea of establishing a "task force" to drive sustainable development and promote the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development (UNCSD): Rio + 20.

The workshop brought out a main concern relating to the lack of internal and external communication between sectors, which acts as a hindrance to sustainable development in Lebanon. While much work has been done on sustainable development in the country, the lack of inter-sectoral communication resulted in the inefficient use of resources. Since the participants were well-versed in context analysis and were well aware of the challenges to implementing sustainable development strategies in the Lebanese case, the workshop was more participatory in nature and became a valuable tool in promoting inter-sectoral dialogue and considering means of coordination. Thus, during the workshop, the participants were frequently divided into working groups to promote and consider coordination in the planning and implementation of national sustainable development. This was seen as a crucial first step towards instigating a process in Lebanon.

The interactive exercises encouraged the participants to define and address Lebanon's key challenges and priority areas for sustainable development. The first day of the workshop, the attendees engaged with one another in small working groups, and then came together to determine what they thought were Lebanon's greatest challenges to achieving sustainable development. They further collaborated to identify and define Lebanon's key priority areas. The discussion between the participants was open and constructive. The second day, the participants again broke into facilitated working groups to construct action plans. The "action plan" exercise invited the participants to determine clear steps to overcome the identified challenges in each priority area.

Following the exercises, the discussion was linked to Lebanon's preparation for the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development (UNCSD), also known as Rio + 20. Given the clear correlation between Rio + 20 and sustainable development, the participants were encouraged to continue their involvement and to take part in ongoing national preparations for Rio + 20 to promote sustainable development.

A. Key Challenges to NSDS in Lebanon

The challenges to NSDS are listed in the Guidance Notes as follows:

1. Poverty, marginalization, and vulnerability
2. Unsustainable exploitation of natural resources and environmental deterioration
3. Insecurity, militarization, and lawlessness
4. Societal divisions
5. Poor governance, corruption, and low capacity
6. Poor economic performance, limited fiscal resources, and disruption of infrastructures and public services
7. Regional and external risks

During the first session, participants were provided a handout which summarized the key challenges to NSDS to help them contextualize them in the Lebanese context (see **Annex 3** for handouts). Each working group then presented its prioritized list to the group as a whole.

When tasked with prioritizing the challenges, the working groups found it difficult to do so, for they emphasized that the challenges listed in the Guidance Notes are interlinked. One group wrote a vertical list of challenges numbered 1 (more important) to 7 (less important), while the two other working groups used different formats to describe how they conceptualize the challenges and their relevance to sustainable development in Lebanon. For example, while "Poverty" (Challenge # 1) is a priority in Lebanon, if "Poor Economic Performance" (Challenge # 6) is first addressed, it could potentially lead to the eradication of poverty (see **Annex 4** for participants' input).

Therefore, the discussion of challenges focused on means of *prioritization*. Many of the participants felt that the government was not properly prioritizing its challenges. One attendee noted that while the government invests in the development of a cosmopolitan city center, communities outside Beirut are marginalized and left without basic amenities.

As a result, rather than prioritizing the challenges, the groups were more inclined to build frameworks with which to approach prioritization issues. An example of a challenge prioritization framework is as follows:
1. Determine which challenges are "upstream," or which may later cause additional challenges.
2. Decipher if any of the challenges could potentially have a "domino effect" leading to greater dissatisfaction.
3. Consider if any of the challenges could be overcome with a "quick fix," so that it could be addressed, and resources could be poured into other areas of challenge.

B. Priority Areas for NSDS in Lebanon

Following the general discussion around the challenges of sustainable development in Lebanon, a presentation of the recent history of planning in Lebanon was shared with the participants. The

facilitators highlighted some points for discussion, such as the context of emergency or the predominant reactive planning (as opposed to the "normal" long-term planning) that has permeated Lebanon. Examples of national strategies in the different domains of the economy, society and environment were shared with an evaluation of the extent to which these comply with sustainable development approaches. The participants were then asked to use the provided examples as a platform to brainstorm on extracting national priorities for planning that cross-cut different sectors (see **Annex 5**).

The participants then brainstormed the most significant priority areas for sustainable development in Lebanon. The selected priority areas were considered the "pillars" for the groups' model NSDS.

The three working groups synthesized their findings and deliberated to come up with the following list of priority areas:

1. Reforming Institutions
2. Environmental Sustainability
3. Economic Development, Social Protection, and Regional Equity
4. Peace Development and Citizenship
5. Crisis Management
6. Security

The participants acknowledged that these pillars do not each stand in isolation, but rather that they are necessarily interlinked, and that together they encompass the broad objectives and sustainable development needs in the Lebanese context.

The main areas of contention when determining what priorities areas merited representation on the list were as follows:

Reforming Institutions:
The participants considered re-wording this pillar as "evaluating," "empowering," or "strengthening" institutions.

Economic Development:
The groups debated whether economic development should be further categorized on a national/local level, or on a regional level. Some participants also advocated for "Pro-poor Economic Development."

Peace Development:
The participants addressed the youth and diversity education as a way to develop peace for future generations, as it addresses awareness and citizen behavior.

Crisis Management
The group agreed that "Crisis Management" is an important priority area in Lebanon, though some suggested that rather than having its own pillar, it should fall under "Security." Those who saw it as a priority elaborated that "crisis" also includes institutional gaps in Lebanon such as the

repeated instances in the last five years where the country had to operate without clear leadership (such as government or the President). Hence, a "crisis management" agenda in such contexts was felt to be necessary.

Security
A debate took place around "Security" and whether it should fall under "Peace Development and Citizenship." Some felt that security should be a broad pillar that includes human, environmental and social elements. Others expressed that security is a cross-cutting objective, and not a pillar.

C. Conference for Sustainable Development: Rio+20

The workshop also dedicated a session to reviewing the preparatory process for the United Nations Conference on Sustainable Development 2012 (Rio+20) and discussing Lebanon's national preparations process. The UNDESA/DSD Project Manager Sami Areikat and Tarek Sadek- First Economic Affairs Officer (Climate Change) in the Sustainable Development and Productivity Division at ESCWA shared information with the attendees on the upcoming Rio+20 conference. They explained the concepts that underpin "Green Economy" and what it means for Lebanon. They also drew links between the Green Economy initiatives and the potential for sustainable development strategies in Lebanon.

D. Action Plans

The participants were divided into working groups the second day, to brainstorm in groups and create action plan matrices, defining and planning the implementation of solutions to each of the challenges in the different priority areas identified the previous day (See Annex 1 for the workshop schedule). An action plan matrix lists the identified pillar, lists an objective statement towards that pillar, and defines the key challenges to achieving that objective (the three key challenges identified on day 1 and sets forth actions, agents and measurable targets to success (see **Annex 4** for the full matrix template).

FOLLOW-UP AND NEXT STEPS

Based on the workshop experience and the progress of the joint project in Lebanon, DESA and ESCWA will discuss "next steps" in cooperation with the Presidency of the Council of Ministers. Also, UNDP will be kept abreast of all activities.

Online Information

The workshop report, as well as main presentations and sample templates, will be posted on the DESA/DSD website (http://www.un.org/esa/dsd/dsd_aofw_nsds/issues.shtml) under Pilot Countries – Lebanon.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Obeid, M. (2011). Review and Assessment of Capacity for Sustainable Development in Lebanon. UNESCWA, July 2011

Republic of Lebanon (2007). Social Action Plan: Towards Strengthening Social Safety Nets and Access to Basic Social Services. January 2007
http://www.lebanon-support.org/resources/DCI/Social%20Action%20Plan%20Rep%20of%20Leb%202007.pdf

United Nations, Common Country Assessment, Lebanon, 1998.

United Nations, Common Country Assessment, Lebanon, 2002.

United Nations, Common Country Assessment, Lebanon, 2007.
United Nations Development Assistance Framework Lebanon (2010-14), May 2009

United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UN-DESA) 'Development Guidance Notes -Developing National Sustainable Development Strategies in Post-Conflict Countries. Strengthening National Capacity for the Integration of Sustainable Development Principles into Development Strategies in Countries Emerging from Conflict', 2011.

ANNEX 1: PROGRAM AGENDA

UNESCWA-UNDESA Workshop
"Strengthening Capacity to Utilize Sustainable Development Principles in National Policy-Making in Lebanon"
6-7 September, 2011 – UN House, Beirut

Day One: Tuesday 6 September 2011			
Concepts and Challenges to Sustainable Development in Lebanon			
Time	**Theme**	**Presenter**	**Notes**
9:30-11:00 SESSION ONE: INTRODUCTOIN			
9:00-9:30	Arrival of participants and Registration		
9:30-9:40	Welcome address by ESCWA	ESCWA Representative	
9:40-10:00	Opening statement	Office of Prime Minister	Contextualizing the workshop and GOL's perspective on development and challenges.
10:00-10:45	• Introduction to workshop objectives, agenda, expected outcomes, participant introduction • Brief introduction of history and concepts and why Lebanon	DESA Representative	
10:45-11:00	Coffee Break		
11:00 -11:45 SESSION TWO: GUIDELINES TO SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGIES			
11:00-11:45	• Introduction to Guidance Notes • Review of five elements, seven key challenges, entry points • Ranking the challenges according to their relevance to Lebanon • Share findings and discussion of a common vision of challenges among the group.	Facilitator and National Expert	
11:45-12:30 SESSION THREE: SUSTAINABLE DEVELOMENT IN LEBANON			
11:45-12:30	• Review of national strategies in Lebanon • Consider the country's approaches to sustainable development in its previous strategy documents; its peacebuilding strategies; and how it has addressed its history of conflict • Brainstorm how to improve its approach in upcoming strategies • Identify entry point to national development	National Expert + Participants	
12:30-14:45	Lunch Break		
14:45- 16:45 SESSION FOUR: DETERMINIG CHALLENGES FOR NSDS OBJECTIVES			
14:45-16:15	Assessing sustainable development challenges most relevant to each of the NSD objectives. Collect data for comparison.	Facilitated Break-out	
16:15-16:30	Coffee Break		
16:30-17:00	Day one wrap-up + plan for Day two.	National Expert + Participants	

Day Two: Wednesday 7 September 2011			
Action Plans For Sustainable Development Planning in Lebanon			
Time	**Theme**	**Presenter**	**Notes**
9:30-11:00 SESSION ONE: Review and discussion of Previous Days' Results			
9:30-9:45	• Review of the Day's Agenda and Objectives • Review Results from previous day	Facilitator and National Expert	
9:45-10:30	• Circulate results from previous day to demonstrate how each group ranked challenges for each NSD objective • Display comparative matrix to show group results □	Facilitator and National Expert	
10:30-10:45	Coffee Break		
10:45 -12:30 SESSION TWO: FORMULATIN ACTION PLANS			
10:45-11:15	• Describe the process of formulating an effective action plan by determining its objectives, conceiving viable solutions, setting up management and implementation techniques, and determining the indicators of success • Establish a working group for each objective □	Facilitator	
11:15-12:15	Break into working groups to formulate focused action plans to address identified challenges for each NSD objective, identify timeline and stakeholder roles	Facilitated Break-out	
12:15-13:15	Lunch Break		
13:15-15:30 SESSION THREE: PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION OF ACTION PLANS			
13:15-14:30	• Working groups present action plans to all participants • Provide plenary group input, suggestions, and constructive changes for to reaching consensus	Participants	
14:30-15:30	Discuss ensuring progress towards objectives, providing the necessary guidance and requirements for capacity development, and leadership mechanisms or participation incentives	Facilitator and National Expert	
15:30-15:45	Coffee Break		
15:45-16:45 SESSION FOUR: FROM NATIONAL TO GLOBAL: RIO+20 THE GREEN ECONOMY			
15:45-16:45	• Review Green Economy initiatives and opportunities in Lebanon • Define the links between the Green Economy initiatives and strategies and poverty eradication, and how they may contribute to Lebanon's sustainable development • Identify the main successes, challenges, and risks • Discuss potential partnerships within the international community and the private sector for a more successful implementation of Green Economy principles in Lebanon • Regional Preparatory Process for Green Economy and Rio+20 in the Arab Region (ESCWA)	DESA/ESCWA	
16:45-17:00	Follow up and closing remarks		

ANNEX 2: LIST OF ATTENDEES

	MEETING PARTICIPANTS					
Title	First Name	Last Name	Organisation	email	phone	Address
Ms.	Lara	Batlouni	Senior Economic Officer UNDP/ Ministry of Finance	laraba@finance.gov.lb	01-981058	Ministry of Finance -Riad El-Sol, Beirut
Ms.	Hana'a	Chehabeddine	Ministry of Agriculture - Lebanese Agricultural Research Institute	chehabeddine.h@gmail.com	01-682471 ext. 121 03-606838	Jdeidit El Meten, Fanar, LARI -P.O. BOX 901965
Mr.	Khalil	Dagher	Program Research Officer - ANND (Arab NGO Network for Development)	khalil.dagher@annd.org	03-177379	Beirut Lebanon
Ms.	Kawthar	Dara	Project Manager- UNDP -CDR	kawthar.dara@undp-lebprojects.org	01-380584	Banks Street AAIB Building, 1st floor, Beirut
Ms.	Caroline	El-Rayes	Institutional Development Specialist-Ministry of Education and Higher Education	celrayes@mehe.gov.lb	01-772 663, 1-789 724/5/6 ext. # 37, 03-742975	UNDP Technical Support Project Education Sector Development Secretariat (ESDS) Habib Abi-Chahla Place, UNESCO Palace Area..P. O. Box 14-
Mr.	Zuhair	Fayadh	System Administrator, Programmer and Economic Researcher, Ministry of Labor	fayadzouheir2002@hotmail.com	03-681773 Home: 05-340151	
Mr.	Khlaed	Fayer	Education Coordinator- Ministry of Education	fayedkhaled@yahoo.com	01-789581	
Mr.	Yahya	Hakim	Managing Director, LTA (Lebanese Transparency Association)	yahyahakim@gmail.com,	01-388113 ext 12	Sami El Solh Av. Manhattan Building, 6th floor, Badaro, Beirut
Mr.	Danny	Haddad	Senior Researcher, LTA (Lebanese Transparency Association)	dhaddad@transparency-lebanon.org	01-388113 ext 16	Sami El Solh Av. Manhattan Building, 6th floor, Badaro, Beirut
Mr.	Redha	Hamdan	Senior Statistician- Consultation and Research Institute	Redha@crilebanon.com	01-801108	
Ms.	Roula	Kabbani	Senior Coordinator- OMSAR	rkabbani@omsar.gov.lb	03-379269	Ain El Mreysseh, Kabbani Bldg
Ms.	Amal	Karaki	Senior Social Development Expet-Council for Development and Reconstruction	amalk@cdr.gov.lb, amal.watfa@gma	01-980096 ext 569	Riyad El Solh Sq. Taller El Serail, P.O. Box: 11/3170, Beirut, Lebanon

	MEETING PARTICIPANTS (CONT.)					
Title	First Name	Last Name	Organisation	email	phone	Address
Mr.	Ziad	Mikati	Prime Minister Office -Public Policy Analysis		03-380333	Grand Serail, Beirut, Lebanon
Ms.	Riwa	Nasreddine	Senior Economic Officer- UNDP/ Ministry of Finance	RiwaN@finance.gov.lb		
Ms.	Dima	Sader	Community development Manager-Economic and Social Fund for Development-CDR	dsader@esfd.cdr.gov.lb	01-373460	Clemenceau, Weavers center, 4th floor
Ms.	Amal	Salibi	head of Economic Studies and Statictics- Ministry of Agriculture	asalibi@terra.net.lb	01-849637 - 03-323969	Bir Hassan- Beirut
Mr.	Assaad	Serhal	Society for the Protection of Nature in Lebanon SPNL	spnlorg@cyberia.net.lb, aserhal@spnl.org	01-343740, 03/349812 (mobile)	Awad Bldg, 6th floor, Abdalaziz st, Hamra Beirut
Ms.	Farah	Shoucair	UNDP/ Ministry of Finance	Farahs@finance.gov.lb		
	FROM UNDESA AND UNESCWA					
Mr.	Sami	Areikat	Sustainable Development Officer	areikat@un.org	1 (212) 963-7844	Division for Sustainable Development (DESA) United Nations, DC2-2112
Mr.	Youssef	Chaitani	ESCWA/ECRI, First Economic Affairs Officer	chaitani@un.org	(961) 1-978619	UN-ESCWA- P.O. Box: 11-8575, Riad El-Solh Beirut, Lebanon
Ms.	Andrea	Gianpoli	DESA, Intern	amgiampoli@gmail.com		
Mr.	Vito	Intini	ESCWA/ECRI, First Economic Affairs Officer	intini@un.org	(961) 1-978618	UN-ESCWA- P.O. Box: 11-8575, Riad El-Solh Beirut, Lebanon
Ms.	Michelle	Obeid	ESCWA, Consultant	Michelle.Obeid@manchester.ac.uk	0161 306-6934	Centre for the Advanced Study of the Arab World (CASAW) Social Anthropology- School of Social Sciences -University of Manchester, Manchester M13 9PL United Kingdom
Ms.	Maria	Ortiz Perez	ESCWA/ECRI, Associate Programme Management Officer	ortizperez@un.org	(961) 1-978621	UN-ESCWA- P.O. Box: 11-8575, Riad El-Solh Beirut, Lebanon
Ms.	Sandy	Ruckstuhl	DESA, Consultant	sruckstuhl@groupw.com	1 (703) 752-5829	Group W Inc. 8315 Lee Highway, Suite 400 Fairfax, VA 22031 USA

ANNEX 3: WORKSHOP HANDOUTS

Guidance Notes Challenges

1. **Poverty, marginalisation, and vulnerability:**
   - Economic, social and political inequality among culturally, ethnically, or socially defined groups.

2. **Unsustainable exploitation of natural resources and environmental deterioration**
   - Direct harm of natural resources and ecosystems, for example, through hazardous substances or overtaxing renewable resources.
   - Indirect harm to the environment often caused by coping strategies of local and displaced people in emergency situations or via uncontrolled overexploitation.

3. **Insecurity, militarization, and lawlessness**
   - Distorted traditional power structures that include active non-state armed groups and easily accessible weapons.
   - Human rights abuses and violent crime.

4. **Societal divisions**
   - Residual politicisation and stereotyping.
   - Bridges between social groups are weak, though group ties and identities within groups are strong.

5. **Poor governance, corruption, and low capacity**
   - Decimation of government institutions and organizational linkages.
   - Poor coordination among local and national institutions, formal and traditional institutions, the state and the (newly developing) civil society.
   - Corruption.
   - "Brain drain," the loss of the country's most skilled workers.

6. **Poor economic performance, limited fiscal resources, and disruption of infrastructures and public services**
   - Damaged infrastructure, scarce employment opportunities, reduced foreign investment, big shadow economies, and increased capital flight.
   - Inability to collect taxes, manage resources, implement policy, or uphold the rule of law.

7. **Regional and external risks**
   - Receipt of support or intervention from other countries that is not context-sensitive.
   - Conflict as a result of the direct or spill-over effect from external involvement.

PRIORITY OBJECTIVES AND CHALLENGES WORKSHEET

Priority/ Objective	Relevant challenges (#s)	Reason

PRIORITY AREA ACTION PLAN MATRIX WORKSHEET

ACTION PLAN MATRIX

Objectives	Actions	Institution in Charge	Output Indicator	Outcome Indicator	Data Source	End Date
PRIORITY AREA:						
PRIORITY OBJECTIVE:						

BURUNDI ACTION PLAN MATRIX (EXAMPLE)

Policy Matrix

This example matrix shows a small sample of policy actions to support the global policy objective of strengthening peace and security in Burundi. The output indicators reinforce the concreteness of each action.

Box 6: Example of Policy Matrix (Burundi)

OBJECTIVES	ACTIONS	INSTITUTION IN CHARGE	OUTPUT INDICATOR	OUTCOME INDICATOR	DATA SOURCE	END DATE
Security Sector						
Global objective: Strengthening peace and security						
1/ Remove residual factors of insecurity						
	Signature and implementation of peace accord with the FNL	Gvt Burndi	Peace accord signed	Absence of armed violence in the most affected provinces		End 2006
	Demobilisation or integration of FNL combattants into the FDN (National Defense Forces) or PNB (Burundi National Police)	MDNAC MISP SE/CNDRR	Number of FNL combattants: ▪ integrated into FDN ▪ integrated into PNB ▪ demobilized	▪ FNL operates only as a political party. ▪ Absence de armed violence in the most affected provinces		End 2006
	Implementation of socio-economic reintegration support programs for demoblized combattants	SE/NCDRR	Number of demobilized combattants benefiting from the reintegration programs	Numbe of demobilized combattants who had received reintegration support and have a paid activity		End 2007
	Audit of all development programs to ensure that they include measures designed to help the reintegration of demoblized combattants	MinPlan CNCA SE/CNDRR	Number of programs audited	Number of demoblized combattants benefiting from these measures		End 2007
	Continuation of training / education programs for already demobilized children	SE/CNDRR	- Number of training progams - Number of demobilized child soldiers having gone back to school - Number of demobilized child soldiers having received training			End 2007

Fruchart, V., Wam, P.E., & Webster, W. Social Development Department. The World Bank Group. (2009). *Effective Poverty Reduction Strategies in Fragile and Conflict-Affected Countries: Lessons and Suggestions*. Conflict, Crime & Violence Issue Note, 18.
http://www.humansecuritygateway.com/documents/WB_EffectivePovertyReductionStrategiesInFragile
AndConflictAffectedCountries.pdf

ANNEX 4: ACTION PLAN MATRICES COMPLETED WORKSHEETS FROM WORKING GROUPS

ACTION PLAN MATRIX

Objectives	Actions	Institution in Charge	Output Indicator	Outcome Indicator	Data Source	End Date
PRIORITY AREA: (pillar) : Strengthening Institutions						
Goal statement: To empower institutions to exercise a proactive role in addressing emerging needs and challenges in time of peace and crisis through a clearly defined private and public partnership						
Efficiency and effectiveness of partnerships is undermined by lack of transparency and trust, and corruption and politicization of processes	• **Automation of processes/ transactions** • **Integrating monitoring and evaluation systems**	• **OMSAR for public institutions** • **Chambers of Commerce/ professional syndicates/U nions/ NGO related monitors**	• **Completio n Time of transactio n decreased** • **M and E tools and systems put in place**	• **Efficie ncy of institu tions enhan ced** • **Trust gap bridge d**	• **Line ministri es records**	**2016**
Outdated existing legislation and processes rendering institutions incapable of exercising their role in an effective and timely manner						
Instability of the local/regional situation leading to interrupted development process adding to existing problems and drain on resources						

ACTION PLAN MATRIX

Objectives	Actions	Institution in Charge	Output Indicator	Outcome Indicator	Data Source	End Date
PRIORITY AREA: Environment Sustainability						
Objective: To promote environmental sustainability through good governance of natural resources by encouraging GREEN production and consumption patterns						
Mismanagement of natural resources (unsustainable consumption and production patterns)	•					
Lack of law Enforcement including existing environmental regulations	• Develop capacities of local stakeholders (municipalities, communities, etc)	• Specialized NGOs • Ministries of Environment/ Agriculture/ Interior	• No. of stakeholders trained	• Reduced environmentally damaging practices • Improved public health outcomes • Presence of balanced ecosystems	Records and progress reports of: • Specialized NGOs • Ministries of Environment/ Agriculture/ Interior	On-going
Advocacy role and authority of Environment NGOs weakened	•					
Lack of Public awareness on the utilization and sustainability of natural resources						
Outdated laws and regulations						

ACTION PLAN MATRIX

Objectives	Actions	Institution in Charge	Output Indicator	Outcome Indicator	Data Source	End Date
PRIORITY AREA: Economic Development and Regional equity						
GOAL STATEMENT: Promoting socio-economic development with specific focus on reducing regional disparities						
Improve access to infrastructure	**Formulate the action plan of the Master Plan (SDATL)**	CDR and line Ministries	Action plan approved by cabinet	Improved access to infrastructure	Gazette	March 2012
	Mobilize resources for implementation	CDR Ministry of Finance Parliament	Resource mobilized			End 2012
Stimulate equitable growth across sectors and creating employment opportunities	**Scaling up credit schemes, in particular for SMEs and informal sector**	**Ministry of Finance Ministry of economy and trade The central Bank NGOs and MFIs ESFD Commercial Banks Local Economic Development Agencies (ART-GOLD)**	Increased access to credits	Increase in employment opportunities		
	Creating incentives to foster investments in marginalized areas	IDAL Ministry of Finance Ministry of Economy and Trade	Increased investment flow to peripheral areas			

20

ACTION PLAN MATRIX

Objectives	Actions	Institution in Charge	Output Indicator	Outcome Indicator	Data Source	End Date
PRIORITY AREA: Strengthen Social protection schemes						
Objective:						
Develop a pension scheme	Finalize the pension and social protection draft law and finalize by parliament	NSSF and Ministry of Labor Ministry of Finance Cabinet Parliament	Law approved			
Improve services provided to marginalized and vulnerable groups	Put law 220/2000 into effect	Parliament Cabinet Ministry of Social Affairs Ministry of Education Ministry of Labor	Procedures and organizational decrees developed	Disabled are better integrated into the society		
Increase social security coverage	Develop and adopt a universal health coverage scheme	NSSF Ministry of Health Ministry of Finance Public insurance funds	Health scheme developed and adopted	Achieve a universal coverage of basic health services		

ACTION PLAN MATRIX

Objectives	Actions	Institution in Charge	Output Indicator	Outcome Indicator	Data Source	End Date
PRIORITY AREA: peace development and citizenship						
Objective:						
Prevent conflicts and minimize effects of sectarianism	Implement activities targeting youth from different groups (youth clubs, dialogues,..)	Ministry of Education Municipalities CSOs UN agencies	Number of activities implemented	Improved social cohesion		
Promote civic education that enforces citizenship	Integrate the principles of citizenships in curricula , particularly a common history book	Ministry of Education	Curricula developed			

Objectives	Actions	Institution in Charge	Output Indicator	Outcome Indicator	Data Source	End Date
PRIORITY AREA: Peace Development and Citizenship						
Objective: To reinforce the adoption and practice of good citizenship by each Lebanese person and group leading to social cohesion and peace sustainability						
Attainment of rights and exercise of duties are inequitable (horizontal inequalities between groups / Vertical: within the same group – rich vs poor)	• Integrating civic education in formal educational curriculum • Setting up Conflict resolution councils – ombudsman • Involve Human Rights NGOs in concerned Parliamentary Committee • Capacity building of judiciary and law enforcement personnel	• MEHE (Ministry of Education and Higher Education)	• Curriculum revised	• Increased tolerance and Less violence in school environment • Decreased juvenile delinquency	MEHE/ National Committee (to be created)	2016

ANNEX 5: EXAMPLE OF GOVERNMENT REFORM PROGRAMME, 'RECOVERY, RECONSTRUCTION, AND REFORM'

Box 1: The Six Pillars of the Recovery Programme 2007

1. Growth-enhancing structural reforms encompassing a large number of measures and laws that would increase productivity and reduce cost, which would enhance the competitiveness of the Lebanese economy;

2. A social sector reform agenda to improve social indicators and strengthen (develop) social safety nets to protect the most vulnerable segments of the population;

3. A strong phased fiscal adjustment that aims at increasing the primary surplus through streamlining expenditures—including by reducing waste (including legalized waste) and reforming state owned enterprises more specifically Electricité du Liban (EdL) – and raising revenues in ways that minimize the negative impact on the poor;

4. A privatization program directed primarily at increasing investment, reducing the stock of public debt, and spurring economic growth;

5. A prudent monetary and exchange rate policy aimed at maintaining price stability (and with it social stability), facilitating credit to the private sector, and maintaining a sound banking system;

6. International financial assistance to help Lebanon finance the direct and indirect cost of the July war as well as to complement the domestic adjustment efforts, primarily by reducing interest payments on public debt and creating the kind of confidence that would encourage private sector investment and ease the pain of a domestic adjustment after the war.

Extracted from Lebanese Republic (2007: 9)

Social Action Plan:

1. to alleviate poverty and improve the quality of education and health indicators;

2. to improve the efficiency of public social spending and keep it at an appropriate and sustainable level;

3. to reduce regional disparities in development indicators through a proper distribution of investment and other resources and encourage investment and other job-creating activities in the more deprived areas (ibid: 13).

Governance:

1. Developing and establishing modern management capacity in key administrations such as the central control and oversight agencies;

2. Reducing the size and cost of the public administration through streamlining its overall organizational structure and functions and modernizing legislation that relates to public procurement and accounting;

3. Promoting a citizen-oriented administration through simplification of procedures and advancing e-Government (Lebanese Republic 2007: 9).

4. Emplacing procedures that will reduce risks of corruption such as establishing a regulatory body to monitor and update the public procurement system.

PROGRAMME OF WORK OF THE MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT OF LEBANON FOR THE YEARS 2010-2012

1. Strengthening environmental inspection and enforcement;

2. Adaptation to the impacts of climate change on natural resources;

3. Air pollution management;

4. Sustainable management of land and soil;

5. Preserving and promoting Lebanon's Ecosystem Capita;

6. Promotion of hazardous and non-hazardous waste management;

7. Promotion of environment-friendly products;

8. Promotion of eco-job opportunities;

9. Striving to improve the working environment in order to preserve environmental health;

10. Activate the role of the Ministry of Environment